

Integrity Pact with Karachi Police for Ensuring Transparency in Licensing Procedures

Project Completion Assessment Report (Partial)

I. Background and the Project

1. In July 2002, Transparency International – Pakistan (TI-Pak) signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the Deputy Inspector General (DIG) of Karachi Police to carry out a detailed study of its Driving License and Vehicles Fitness Test Departments “with regard to the existing situation of Rent Seeking and make its recommendation”. Soon thereafter, TI-Pak requested Partnership for Transparency Fund (PTF) for a grant to support its work with the Karachi Traffic Police (KTP). A Grant Agreement was signed between PTF and TI-Pak in December 2002.

2. For various reasons the work on the KTP project proceeded slowly. So far work has been completed on the Driving license component while the final recommendation with respect to the Vehicles Fitness Test has been submitted by TI-Pak to KTP but the senior management of KTP has not yet taken any decision on the recommendations. Therefore, this report covers only the completed component relating to the Driving License.

3. This report is based on a review of the basic documents (the original and the Revised Project Proposal¹, MOU, the Grant Agreement, Cost Estimates, and the Final Project Report²), discussions with TI-Pak and a site visit (January 2004) to KTP’s driving License Issuing facilities followed by discussions with officers in-charge of issuing Driving Licenses.

II. Assessment of Project Achievements

Project Objectives³ & Design

4. The project objective was to introduce transparency in the process of issuance of Driving Licenses by KTP to make them easier and cleaner so that the opportunities for “speed money” (corruption) are minimized. An implicit and subsidiary objective was to adopt modern practices so that risks of fraud are reduced.

5. As detailed in its final report (July 25, 2003), TI-Pak carried out a thorough review of the existing procedures, systems as well as the applicable laws and regulations and made comprehensive recommendations to achieve the project objectives. The recommendations covered procedures for the issuance of the Learner’s as well as Permanent License, use of computers and cameras, the structure of fees, the contents and availability of application forms, medical/vision tests, etc.

¹ Dated December 26, 2002.

² Transparency International – Pakistan, “Final Recommendations for Ensuring Transparency in the Procedures for Obtaining Learners and Permanent Driving Licenses”, July 25, 2003.

³ The project objectives defined in the original Project Proposal related to two components. In this report objectives that specifically relate to the Driving License component have been noted.

6. The TI-Pak report was discussed at various level of KTP and some decisions taken and implemented to improve the overall working of the Driving License Department. The measures taken include introduction of smart cards, which contain all relevant information and are difficult to make fake copies, streamlining of procedures, introduction of computerized record keeping, and assignment of some additional staff. However, a number of PTI-Pak recommendations have not been implemented including introduction of a website, sending Driving License by mail to the home address to ensure the genuineness of the applicant, registration of out-of-station drivers, simulated driving tests, and establishing of four more offices for the issuance of Driving Licenses. Shortage of funding is stated to be the main reason for not accepting these recommendations even though TI-Pak had offered to arrange seed money.

7. Given a partial acceptance of the recommendations of TI-Pak, the project was objective was achieved only partially. However, this does not mean a project failure, for two reasons: (a) a need for further reforms in the Driving License Department is fully recognized at the level of officers running the department. (Fortunately, these officers seem to be quite dedicated and conscious of their public responsibility). They are constantly in touch with TI-Pak exploring the ways and means of further improving the working of the Department; and (b) there is a palpable improvement in the working atmosphere in the Department. Already the new system, which can be further improved, has improved to a stage that an applicant, if willing to spend a few hours, can obtain a license without paying any “Speed Money”. However, it is till time consuming, a few hours longer it takes in Virginia DMV. Also, only one office for the issuance of Driving Licenses is far too insufficient for city of a population of more than 13 million people.

8. The original methodology proposed for the preparation of the project consisted of: (a) reviews of existing relevant laws, technical documentations, and draft IP by international experts, if necessary; (b) coordination of draft documents and consultations with stakeholders; and (c) media campaign and dissemination all of them be a party to an Integrity Pact. This methodology worked well and was quite appropriate to formulate practicable reforms.

9. The project design was comprehensive. However, one could argue that it was ambitious specially given that recommendations were only partially accepted and implemented. On the other hand, one should also recognize that in an environment of entrenched vested interests (mostly illegitimate, i.e., rent seeking) that prevails in Karachi Police an expectation of full acceptance of all recommendations and a complete turn around will also be unrealistic. On the whole, it was a wise approach to address the problem in its totality so that at least some reforms were made.

Institution Building Impact

10. In broad terms, the institution building impact of the project is reasonably positive. The work of TI-Pak, created an occasion for the senior officers of Karachi Police and its Traffic Departments to focus on the need to improve its working and ultimately there was a heightened level of awareness for a need for a better service. This awareness lead to some improvement as discussed in paragraphs 6 and 7 above. Better and more people are now assigned to the Driving License Department; and there is a possibility of some further improvements as mentioned above. This in itself is a commendable achievement. However, there is a need for a monitoring at regular intervals.

Implementation Experience

11. After some initial delay, the project implementation proceeded according to the plans. Most inputs were delivered including review of laws, documents, coordination and consultations. According to details of expenses provided by TI-Pak, total costs incurred amounted to US\$19,000 for the two project components (Annex). These expenses need to be audited and certified by qualified and independent auditors.

Khalid Siraj
Vienna, Virginia
March 14, 2004



TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Strives to make Pakistan a better country to live in

INTERIM EXPENSES AS ON JANUARY 21, 2004
“ENSURING TRANSPARENCY IN KCTPD”

Fees for Consultant and Advisory services.	Original	Interim
	(US \$)	
* One Legal Expert (local) to associate with IT Pak team for reviewing and revising the present Police Laws, Acts, Procedures etc. - 3 Man Month @ US \$ 1,500 / Month (Part payment)	4,500.00	4,500.00
* One Technical expert (Local Retired Senior Police Officer) - 3 Man Month @ US \$ 1,500 / Month (Part Payment)	4,500.00	4,500.00
<hr/>		
Interviews and Workshop		
Various interviews and 2-Nos. Workshops / Seminars, with Stakeholders viz. Police Transporters Unions, NGO's, CBO's, etc . - Lump Sum	3,500.00	3,500.00
These surveys, meetings etc. shall be coordinated by TI-Pakistan.		
<hr/>		
Media Advertisement of IP - Public Awareness		
- Lump Sum	3,500.00	3,000.00
This will include press advertising, a press conference etc. and shall be coordinated by TI-Pakistan.		
<hr/>		
Secretarial Services, Printing, Stationery and Administrative and Overhead Expenses. Including Contingencies		
TI-Pakistan's involvement of Administrative and Other Interviewing staff, including Transportation, Communication etc. - Lump sum	4,000.00	3,500.00
<hr/>		
TOTAL EXPENSES TO DATE	20,000.00	19,000.00
Contract Value	US\$ 20,000.00	
Expenditure to-date	US\$ 19,000.00	

WE SHALL BE ORGANIZING A FINAL PRESENTATION AND PRESS CONFERENCE AT THE END OF THE PROJECT HOPEFULLY WITH THE INSPECTOR GENERAL POLICE.

Important Note: The Cost of the International Expert earlier requested for has not been approved by PTF which we hoped could be utilized at the end of the project towards the trip of two members of the KCTPD Police and one TI-Pakistan representative to visit the Traffic Police Departments in Hong Kong and Singapore as recommended in our original proposal.

Shaukat Omari
Executive Director
Date: January 21, 2004

Shaikh Faisal
Accountant